

Analysis of Police Services Contracting Proposals

City of Pacifica

Community Forum Presentation

April 4 and 6, 2013



Project Purpose

- Evaluate informal proposals from the City of South San Francisco and San Mateo County Sheriff's Office
 - Assess limited information provided
 - Fill information gaps
 - Identify areas for further analysis
 - Specifically asked not to provide any recommendations



Project Methodology

- Conducted Interviews
 - Pacifica City Manager and Police Chief
 - South San Francisco Police Management staff
 - San Mateo County Sheriff Management staff
 - City Managers of San Carlos, Half Moon Bay, and Millbrae
- Reviewed and Analyzed Information
 - Data received from South San Francisco and San Mateo County Sheriff's Office
 - Agency budgets
 - Staff deployment lists
 - Memorandums of Understanding (MOUs)
 - Current agreements (i.e., South San Francisco communications contract)



Pacifica Police Department

Characteristic	Data
Service Population	37,234
FY 2012-13 Budget	\$8,661,403
Full Time Equivalent Positions	38
Crime Rate – Three Year Average	191.58
Police Cost Per Resident	\$233







Recent Changes to Pacifica Police Department

Fiscal Year	Budget	Positions
FY 2009-10	\$9,250,746	49
FY 2011-12	\$9,016,597	40 ¹
FY 2012-13	\$8,661,403	38

¹Outsourced dispatch and communications to South San Francisco



City of South San Francisco Police Department

Characteristic	Data
Service Population	63,632
FY 2011-12 Budget	\$19,979,112
Full-Time Equivalent Positions	107
Crime Rate – Three Year Average	243.17
Police Cost Per Resident	\$314







South San Francisco Police Department

- Police facility is located 7.5 miles from Pacifica
 Police headquarters
- Currently provides dispatch/communications to Pacifica with favorable performance to date
- Professional and well-regarded agency
- New to contracting full-police services
- City of South San Francisco has structural deficit that could potentially impact services



San Mateo County Sheriff's Office

- Has broad law enforcement responsibility
 - Corrections
 - Court security and transportation of prisoners
 - Patrol and investigative services
 - Office of Emergency Services
 - Forensic laboratory
- FY 2012-13 budget of \$193,855,364
- Full-time equivalent positions: 669



San Mateo County Sheriff's Office Patrol Bureau

Characteristic	Data
Total Service Population	132,124
Unincorporated	61,222
Municipal (contract)	70,902
FY 2012-13 Budget	\$42,803,636
Full-Time Equivalent Positions	153
Crime Rate for Unincorporated Areas – Three Year Average	328.14
Cost Per Resident	\$324







San Mateo County Sheriff's Office

- Significant support resources available
- Committed to contract policing
- Favorable assessment of contract service delivery
- Considerable growth since 2010
 - Service population has increased by 61,262
 - Matriculation of new officers
 - Radio/communications infrastructure challenges



Basic Services	Pacifica	South San Francisco	San Mateo County
Personnel Costs	\$6,228,029	\$7,058,466	\$6,201,433



Basic Services	Pacifica	South San Francisco	San Mateo County
Personnel Costs	\$6,228,029	\$7,058,466	\$6,201,433
Non Personnel Costs	\$1,646,228	\$538,886	\$941,966



Basic Services	Pacifica	South San Francisco	San Mateo County
Personnel Costs	\$6,228,029	\$7,058,466	\$6,201,433
Non Personnel Costs	\$1,646,228	\$538,886	\$941,966
Administration Costs	0	\$759,735	\$297,871



Basic Services	Pacifica	South San Francisco	San Mateo County
Personnel Costs	\$6,228,029	\$7,058,466	\$6,201,433
Non Personnel Costs	\$1,646,228	\$538,886	\$941,966
Administration Costs	<u>0</u>	<u>\$759,735</u>	<u>\$297,871</u>
Basic Services Costs	\$7,874,257	\$8,357,087	\$7,441,280



Basic Services	Pacifica	South San Francisco	San Mateo County
Personnel Costs	\$6,228,029	\$7,058,466	\$6,201,433
Non Personnel Costs	\$1,646,228	\$538,886	\$941,966
Administration Costs	<u>0</u>	<u>\$759,735</u>	<u>\$297,871</u>
Basic Services Costs	\$7,874,257	\$8,357,087	\$7,441,280
Difference to Pacifica		\$482,830	\$(432,977)



Basic Services	Pacifica	South San Francisco	San Mateo County
Personnel Costs	\$6,228,029	\$7,058,466	\$6,201,433
Non Personnel Costs	\$1,646,228	\$538,886	\$941,966
Administration Costs	<u>0</u>	<u>\$759,735</u>	<u>\$297,871</u>
Basic Services Costs	\$7,874,257	\$8,357,087	\$7,441,280
Difference to Pacifica		\$482,830	\$(432,977)
Pension Bond Obligation	\$787,146	0	0



Basic Services	Pacifica	South San Francisco	San Mateo County
Personnel Costs	\$6,228,029	\$7,058,466	\$6,201,433
Non Personnel Costs	\$1,646,228	\$538,886	\$941,966
Administration Costs	<u>0</u>	<u>\$759,735</u>	<u>\$297,871</u>
Basic Services Costs	\$7,874,257	\$8,357,087	\$7,441,280
Difference to Pacifica		\$482,830	\$(432,977)
Pension Bond Obligation	<u>\$787,146</u>	<u>0</u>	<u>0</u>
TOTAL COSTS	\$8,661,403	\$8,357,087	\$7,441,280
Difference to Pacifica		\$(304,316)	\$(1,220,123)



Support Costs	South San Francisco	San Mateo County
Facility Maintenance	\$66,276	\$66,276
Utilities, etc.	\$25,375	\$25,375



Support Costs	South San Francisco	San Mateo County
Facility Maintenance	\$66,276	\$66,276
Utilities, etc.	\$25,375	\$25,375
Dispatch/Communications	\$632,844	\$0



Support Costs	South San Francisco	San Mateo County
Facility Maintenance	\$66,276	\$66,276
Utilities, etc.	\$25,375	\$25,375
Dispatch/Communications	\$632,844	\$0
Contractual Costs	\$65,690	\$65,690
County Charges	\$199,015	\$149,015



Support Costs	South San Francisco	San Mateo County
Facility Maintenance	\$66,276	\$66,276
Utilities, etc.	\$25,375	\$25,375
Dispatch/Communications	\$632,844	\$0
Contractual Costs	\$65,690	\$65,690
County Charges	<u>\$199,015</u>	<u>\$149,015</u>
Total Support Costs	\$989,200	\$306,356



Basic Services	Pacifica	South San Francisco	San Mateo County
Personnel Costs	\$6,228,029	\$7,058,466	\$6,201,433
Non Personnel Costs	\$1,646,228	\$538,886	\$941,966
Administration	0	\$759,735	\$297,871



Basic Services	Pacifica	South San Francisco	San Mateo County
Personnel Costs	\$6,228,029	\$7,058,466	\$6,201,433
Non Personnel Costs	\$1,646,228	\$538,886	\$941,966
Administration	0	\$759,735	\$297,871
Support Costs	0	\$989,200	\$306,356



Basic Services	Pacifica	South San Francisco	San Mateo County
Personnel Costs	\$6,228,029	\$7,058,466	\$6,201,433
Non Personnel Costs	\$1,646,228	\$538,886	\$941,966
Administration	0	\$759,735	\$297,871
Support Costs	0	\$989,200	\$306,356
Pension Bond Obligation	<u>\$787,146</u>	<u>\$0</u>	<u>\$0</u>



Basic Services	Pacifica	South San Francisco	San Mateo County
Personnel Costs	\$6,228,029	\$7,058,466	\$6,201,433
Non Personnel Costs	\$1,646,228	\$538,886	\$941,966
Administration	0	\$759,735	\$297,871
Support Costs	0	\$989,200	\$306,356
Pension Bond Obligation	<u>\$787,146</u>	<u>\$0</u>	<u>\$0</u>
TOTAL COSTS	\$8,661,403	\$9,346,287	\$7,747,636
Difference to Pacifica		\$686,884	\$(913,767)



		San Mateo
First-Year Start-Up	South San Francisco	County
Pacifica Employee Separations	\$400,000	\$400,000



		San Mateo
First-Year Start-Up	South San Francisco	County
Pacifica Employee Separations	\$400,000	\$400,000
Vehicles, Equipment, Training	\$932,000	\$932,000



First-Year Start-Up	South San Francisco	San Mateo County
Pacifica Employee Separations	\$400,000	\$400,000
Vehicles, Equipment, Training	\$932,000	\$932,000
Pacifica Credit for Assets	\$(350,00)	\$(350,000)



First-Year Start-Up	South San Francisco	San Mateo County
Pacifica Employee Separations	\$400,000	\$400,000
Vehicles, Equipment, Training	\$932,000	\$932,000
Pacifica Credit for Assets	<u>\$(350,00)</u>	<u>\$(350,000)</u>
Total First Year Start-up Costs	\$982,000	\$982,000



Basic Services	Pacifica	South San Francisco	San Mateo County
Personnel Costs	\$6,228,029	\$7,058,466	\$6,201,433
Non Personnel Costs	\$1,646,228	\$538,886	\$941,966



Basic Services	Pacifica	South San Francisco	San Mateo County
Personnel Costs	\$6,228,029	\$7,058,466	\$6,201,433
Non Personnel Costs	\$1,646,228	\$538,886	\$941,966
Administration	\$0	\$759,735	\$297,871
Support Costs	\$0	\$989,200	\$306,356
Pension Bond Obligation	\$787,146	\$0	\$0



Basic Services	Pacifica	South San Francisco	San Mateo County
Personnel Costs	\$6,228,029	\$7,058,466	\$6,201,433
Non Personnel Costs	\$1,646,228	\$538,886	\$941,966
Administration	\$0	\$759,735	\$297,871
Support Costs	\$0	\$989,200	\$306,356
Pension Bond Obligation	\$787,146	\$0	\$0
First-Year Start-Up Costs	<u>\$0</u>	\$982,000	\$982,000



Basic Services	Pacifica	South San Francisco	San Mateo County
Personnel Costs	\$6,228,029	\$7,058,466	\$6,201,433
Non Personnel Costs	\$1,646,228	\$538,886	\$941,966
Administration	\$0	\$759,735	\$297,871
Support Costs	\$0	\$989,200	\$306,356
Pension Bond Obligation	\$787,146	\$0	\$0
First-Year Start-Up Costs	<u>\$0</u>	\$982,000	<u>\$982,000</u>
TOTAL COSTS	\$8,661,403	\$10,328,287	\$8,729,636
Difference to Pacifica		\$1,666,884	\$68,233



Basic Services	Pacifica	South San Francisco	San Mateo County
TOTAL COSTS	\$8,661,403	\$10,328,287	\$8,729,636
Difference to Pacifica		\$1,666,884	\$68,233



Basic Services	Pacifica	South San Francisco	San Mateo County
TOTAL COSTS	\$8,661,403	\$10,328,287	\$8,729,636
Difference to Pacifica		\$1,666,884	\$68,233
Pension Bond Credit		\$0	\$(787,146)



Basic Services	Pacifica	South San Francisco	San Mateo County
TOTAL COSTS	\$8,661,403	\$10,328,287	\$8,729,636
Difference to Pacifica		\$1,666,884	\$68,233
Pension Bond Credit		<u>\$0</u>	<u>\$(787,146)</u>
TOTAL COSTS	\$8,661,403	\$10,328,287	\$7,942,490
Difference to Pacifica		\$1,666,884	\$(718,913)



Pension Obligation Bond (POB) Debt Pacifica Police Department

Fiscal Year	POB Debt
Fiscal Year 2012-13	\$787,146
Fiscal Year 2013-14	\$813,554



Pension Obligation Bond (POB) Debt Pacifica Police Department

Fiscal Year	POB Debt
Fiscal Year 2012-13	\$787,146
Fiscal Year 2013-14	\$813,554
Fiscal Year 2014-15	\$840,542
Fiscal Year 2015-16	\$869,137
Fiscal Year 2016-17	<u>\$161,819</u>
Total Five-Year Costs	\$3,472,198



Comparison of Five-Year Annual Costs for City of Pacifica

Year	Projected Cost Annual 3% Increase
Fiscal Year 2012-13	\$8,661,403
Fiscal Year 2013-14	\$8,921,245
Fiscal Year 2014-15	\$9,188,882
Fiscal Year 2015-16	\$9,464,549
Fiscal Year 2016-17	\$9,008,48 <u>5</u>
Total Five-Year Costs	\$45,244,564



South San Francisco Projected Costs (with POB Debt)

Fiscal Year	Annual 3% Increase	POB Debt	Cost w/ POB
Fiscal Year 2012-13	\$10,328,287	\$787,146	\$11,115,443



South San Francisco Projected Costs (with POB Debt)

Fiscal Year	Annual 3% Increase	POB Debt	Cost w/ POB
Fiscal Year 2012-13	\$10,328,287	\$787,146	\$11,115,443
Fiscal Year 2013-14	\$9,626,676	\$813,554	\$10,440,230
Fiscal Year 2014-15	\$9,915,476	\$840,542	\$10,756,018



South San Francisco Projected Costs (with POB Debt)

Fiscal Year	Annual 3% Increase	POB Debt	Cost w/ POB
Fiscal Year 2012-13	\$10,328,287	\$787,146	\$11,115,443
Fiscal Year 2013-14	\$9,626,676	\$813,554	\$10,440,230
Fiscal Year 2014-15	\$9,915,476	\$840,542	\$10,756,018
Fiscal Year 2015-16	\$10,212,940	\$869,137	\$11,082,077
Fiscal Year 2016-17	<u>\$10,519,328</u>	<u>\$161,819</u>	<u>\$10,681,147</u>
Total Five-Year Costs	\$50,602,707	\$3,472,198	\$54,074,905



South San Francisco Projected Five-Year Cost (with POB Debt)

Cost	Amount
Pacifica Police Department's Five-Year Projected Cost	\$45,244,564
South San Francisco Projected Five-Year Cost	\$54,074,905



South San Francisco Projected Five-Year Cost (with POB Debt)

Cost	Amount
Pacifica Police Department's Five-Year Projected Cost	\$45,244,564
South San Francisco Projected Five-Year Cost	\$54,074,905
Pacifica Five-Year Total Increase Costs Contracting With SSFPD	\$8,830,341
Annual Average Cost Increase	\$1,766,068



San Mateo County Sheriff's Office Five-Year Projected Costs

Fiscal Year	Annual 3% Increase
Fiscal Year 2012-13	\$8,729,636
Fiscal Year 2013-14	\$7,980,065



San Mateo County Sheriff's Office Five-Year Projected Costs

Fiscal Year	Annual 3% Increase	
Fiscal Year 2012-13	\$8,729,636	
Fiscal Year 2013-14	\$7,980,065	
Fiscal Year 2014-15	\$8,219,467	
Fiscal Year 2015-16	\$8,466,051	
Fiscal Year 2016-17	\$8,720,033	
Total Five-Year Costs	\$42,115,252	



Comparison of San Mateo County's Projected Five-Year Costs with POB Credit with Pacifica Projected Costs

Cost	Amount
Pacifica Police Department's Projected Five-Year Cost (not including POB debt payments)	\$41,772,366



Comparison of San Mateo County's Projected Five-Year Costs with POB Credit with Pacifica Projected Costs

Cost	Amount
Pacifica Police Department's Projected Five-Year Cost (not including POB debt payments)	\$41,772,366
San Mateo County Projected Five-Year Cost	\$42,115,252



Comparison of San Mateo County's Projected Five-Year Costs with POB Credit with Pacifica Projected Costs

Cost	Amount
Pacifica Police Department's Projected Five-Year Cost (not including POB debt payments)	\$41,772,366
San Mateo County Projected Five-Year Cost	\$42,115,252
Pacifica Total Five-Year POB Cost	\$3,472,198



Comparison of San Mateo County's Projected Five-Year Costs with POB Credit with Pacifica Projected Costs

Cost	Amount
Pacifica Police Department's Projected Five-Year Cost (not including POB debt payments)	\$41,772,366
San Mateo County Projected Five-Year Cost	\$42,115,252
Pacifica Total Five-Year POB Cost	\$3,472,198
Pacifica Projected Five-Year Cost with POB Credit	\$38,643,054



Comparison of San Mateo County's Projected Five-Year Costs with POB Credit with Pacifica Projected Costs

Cost	Amount
Pacifica Police Department's Projected Five-Year Cost (not including POB debt payments)	\$41,772,366
San Mateo County Projected Five-Year Cost	\$42,115,252
Pacifica Total Five-Year POB Cost	\$3,472,198
Pacifica Projected Five-Year Cost with POB Credit	\$38,643,054
Pacifica Total Five-Year Cost Decrease	\$3,129,312



Staffing Comparisons

- Proposals were based on limited information
- Current Pacifica staffing levels
- Calls for service or other workload measures were not provided



Comparison of Sworn Officers

Sworn Positions	Pacifica	South San Francisco	San Mateo County
Chief	1	0	0
Captain	2	0	0
Lieutenant	0	1	1
Sergeant	7	5	5
Detectives (Corporal)	3	3	3
Officer/Deputy	<u>20</u>	<u>23</u>	<u>16</u>
Sworn Total	33	32	25



Comparison of Professional Staff (FTEs)

Professional Staff	Pacifica	South San Francisco	San Mateo County
Evidence Technician	1.0	0.0	0.0
Records Supervisor	1.0	0.0	1.0
Administrative Assistant	0.5	0.5	1.0
Records Clerk	1.0	1.5	0.0
Systems Specialist (IT)	1.0	1.0	0.0
Comm. Service Officer	0.0	0.0	2.0
Court Liaison	0.0	0.5	0.5
Property/Evidence Clerk	0.5	<u>1.5</u>	0.5
Professional Staff Total	5.0	5.0	5.0



Comparison of Proposals – Staffing

Pacifica Police Department

38 FTEs

South San Francisco PD

37 FTEs

San Mateo County Sheriff

30 FTEs

The primary difference is the number of officers assigned to patrol



Staffing Comparisons

- Service levels are based on Pacifica's field deployment model
- Service levels are measured in patrol hours
- Productive work hours (PWH) were also analyzed



Comparison of Proposals - Staffing

- Productive Work Hours
 - Employees are paid based on 2,080 or 2,184 annual work hours
 - PWH are the number of hours an employee actually worked
 - PWH deducts employee time off for vacations, holidays, sick, injuries, training, etc.
- Pacifica PWH
- South San Francisco PWH
- San Mateo County PWH

1,643 hours/year

1,566 hours/year

1,757 hours/year



Productive Work Hours by Variance Category and Agency

		South San	
Variance Category	Pacifica	Francisco	SMCSO
Vacation	194	160	166
Sick	73	30	40
Holiday	18	104	0
Comp Time	0	100	0
Training	47	100	116
Miscellaneous	0	20	0
Military, Family Leave	0	0	60
Off Injured	64	0	45
Light Duty	<u>31</u>	<u>0</u>	<u>0</u>
Total Variance	427	514	427
Work Schedule	2,080	2,080	2,184
Productive Work Hours	1,653	1,566	1,757



Pacifica Patrol Deployment Model

Hours	Positions	Annual Service Hours
7:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m.	3	10,920
4:00 p.m. to 2:00 a.m.	4	14,560
10:00 p.m. to 8:00 a.m.	3	<u>10,920</u>
Total		36,400



Proposed Staffing Differences (Pacifica Patrol Service Model)

Agency	Officers Required	Assigned	Difference
Pacifica	22.02	20	-2.02
SSFPD	23.24	23	-0.24
SMCSO	20.72	16	-4.72



Patrol Deployment Analysis

- Pacifica Increase staff or pay overtime to meet service criteria
- SSFPD Adequately staffed to Pacifica model specifications
- SMCSO Staffed with fewer officers than Pacifica model



Patrol Deployment Analysis

- SMCSO Staffed with fewer officers than Pacifica model
 - Proposal based on similar, but different service criteria
 - Used 12-hour shift deployment
 - Overlap hours in the 10-hour shift (Pacifica model) were reduced or eliminated



Patrol Deployment Analysis

- SMCSO Staffed with fewer officers than Pacifica model
 - Proposal based on similar, but different service criteria
 - Used 12-hour shift deployment
 - Overlap hours in the 10-hour shift (Pacifica model) were reduced or eliminated
- SMCSO Basic Services cost would increase if it used Pacifica model
- SSF costs would decrease if they used SMCSO model



South San Francisco Proposed Deployment

- Lieutenant assigned to serve as chief
 - Concern that lieutenant lacks positional authority
 - Structure of SSFPD and size of Pacifica warrant captain rank
- Sergeant deployment is adequate
 - Four in the field and one assigned to investigations
 - Some shared supervision with SSF during non-peak hours
- Assignment of three investigators is adequate
- Professional staff support is adequate



San Mateo County Sheriff Proposed Deployment

- Lieutenant assigned to serve as chief; conforms to Sheriff's contract model
- Field and investigator supervision is adequate (provision for shared investigator supervisor)
- Assignment of three investigators is adequate
 - Investigations not under direct management of Pacifica lieutenant
- Professional staff support is adequate



Additional Observations

- SSFPD location is conducive to providing police services
- SMCSO currently has service delivery in Millbrae, Half Moon Bay and County coast area
- SSFPD and SMCSO both provide for dedicated service models
- SSFPD and SMCSO would consider hiring all qualified Pacifica police employees



San Mateo County Sheriff Client Feedback

- Interviewed City Managers of San Carlos, Half Moon Bay and Millbrae
- All are supportive of the Sheriff contract process and services provided
- Anecdotal information indicates positive community support



Possible Alternatives

- Continue providing police services in-house
- Contract police services
 - Commence a formal process for proposals
 - Negotiate directly with one agency
 - Establish performance measures and costcontainment protocols in the contract



Important Performance Indices for Contract Police Services

- Monthly review of:
 - Compliance with patrol service hour hours specified in contract
 - Patrol response times
 - All crime data including lesser crimes
 - Investigator case management (hours spent, cases closed)
 - Traffic collision and citation productivity ratios
 - Risk management issues such as personnel complaints, use of force, and claims against either agency for actions taken in Pacifica
 - Type and number of community outreach efforts
 - Type and number of emergency services coordination and training programs



Questions?



Thank you!

Ted Siara
714-801-2428
tsiara@managementpartners.com

